

Report 08.151

13 March 2008

File: E/6/10/6

m:wpdata/min/hra/08.151.doc

**Unconfirmed Minutes of the Meeting of the Hutt River
Advisory Subcommittee held in the Council Chamber,
Hutt City Council, 30 Laings Road, Lower Hutt, on
Thursday, 13 March 2008 at 4.30pm**

Present

Councillor Greig (Chairperson)

Councillors Buchanan, Glensor, Kirton and Lamason (Greater Wellington
Regional Council)

Mayor Ogden, Councillors Baird, Cousins and Hislop (Hutt City Council)

Mayor Guppy, Councillors Austin, Gwilliam and Rabbitt (Upper Hutt City
Council).

Also Present

Councillor Wilde (Greater Wellington Regional Council).

Officers Present

Atapattu, Benham, Campbell, Cox, Dick, and Ryan (Greater Wellington
Regional Council), Stallinger (Hutt City Council).

Public Business

HRA 71 Apologies

Resolved

(Cr Lamason/Cr Kirton)

That the Subcommittee

Accepts the apologies for absence from Mr Puketapu and the apology for lateness for Cr Gwilliam.

HRA 72 Conflict of Interest declaration

There were no declarations of conflict of interest.

HRA 73 Public Participation

1. Dennis Page

Dennis Page spoke to his written submission circulated in the Order Paper, summarising the key points. He advised that he supported the Boulcott Alternative alignment proposal.

2. Ruth Gilmore

Ruth Gilmore questioned the need for flood protection near her residence in Hathaway Avenue. She was also concerned about the impact a high stopbank near her property would have on her property's value and her view of the golf course. She considered that the stopbank proposals were designed to accommodate the golf club, when there is an abundance of golf courses in the Hutt valley.

3. David Graham

David Graham advised that the draft minutes of the Hutt River Advisory Committee meeting of 6 September 2007 did not correctly record his comments made under Public Participation. He advised that his comments made at that meeting were to the effect that:

- He originally supported the blue line proposal, but as the detail was developed he realised there was not enough space for it and the impact on neighbours was significant; for instance, he faced a car park above his head.
- He couldn't comment on whether the clubs should amalgamate, but if the Boulcott club did close or amalgamate he urged councillors to take a leadership role in using the green space for the community.

Mr Graham also spoke to a tabled submission. He advised that he supported the Boulcott Alternative alignment proposal.

4. Boulcott Golf Club (Colin Carter and Andrew Beatson)

Colin Carter advised that he was authorised to appear on the club's behalf. He was accompanied by Andrew Beatson, the club's legal representative.

He advised that the club is comfortable with the Boulcott Alternative alignment, and that it had agreed to forego approximately \$200,000 in compensation and undertake at least \$200,000 work on greens and tees with its own resources. He considered that any additional savings over the \$200,000 already agreed, should be seen as a positive result and split 50/50 between the club and Greater Wellington. He advised that the club can only survive with the Boulcott Alternative alignment, and if the Green alignment were to proceed the club would be duty-bound under its constitution to fight the decision through the Public Works Act and Resource Management Act processes. The club is committed to operating a viable golf course. Mr Carter urged the subcommittee to consider the costs and other implications of a prolonged, legally contested process if the Green alignment were to be approved by Council.

5. Hutt Golf Club (Rod Gillespie)

The club accepts that the red option is not preferred; the club's fall-back position is the green line through Hutt Golf Club land, in conjunction with the bund adjacent to Harcourt Werry Drive.

Mr Gillespie advised that a merger of the Hutt Golf Club with the Boulcott Golf Club would be unlikely to proceed as the Boulcott Golf Club is committed to retaining its club and course.

The club is very aware of the impact of the proposed stopbank on neighbours adjacent to the club's first tee. Mr Gillespie advised that the club would lower the playing area and tee to help mitigate their concerns. The club accepts that flood protection is required, and would not accept any rerouting of the stopbank. He noted that the club is yet to discuss the matter of compensation with Greater Wellington officers.

Councillor Gwilliam arrived at 5.25pm.

HRA 74 Confirmation of Minutes

Resolved

(Cr Glensor/Baird)

That the Subcommittee

Confirms the minutes of the meeting held on 6 September 2007, Report 08.119, subject to amendments relating to the Public Participation comments of David Graham.

HRA 75 **Confirmation of the preferred Boulcott/Hutt stopbank alignment**

Report 08.123

File: N/03/18/02

The Subcommittee held a wide-ranging discussion about the preferred alignment before voting on the matter.

Moved (Cr Ogden/Cr Glensor)

That the Subcommittee

1. *Receives the report.*
2. *Notes the contents of the report.*
3. *Notes that officers have now investigated alternative options for the Green alignment, working with the Boulcott Golf Club and the other affected parties, and have developed a new option called the Boulcott Alternative.*
4. *Notes that both the Green and the Boulcott Alternative alignments provide equivalent flood security and sustainability to the Hutt community.*
5. *Notes that the Green alignment costs \$10.4 million and the Boulcott Alternative costs \$12.8 million.*
6. *Recommends to the Catchment Management Committee that it endorses for Council approval:*
 - 6.2a *That officers should proceed with obtaining statutory approvals, the detailed design and finalising the land and entry negotiations on the basis of the Boulcott Alternative alignment subject to entering a suitable arrangement with the Boulcott Golf Club that will ensure the BGC:*
 - *Foregoes approximately \$200,000 of the estimated compensation due to them.*
 - *Undertakes at least \$200,000 of worth of work on Greens and Tees associated with the Boulcott alignment with their own resources.*
 - *Transfers the title of the BGC land to GW on the condition that GW lease back the land to the club at a nominal rate.*
 - *Enters into an agreement with GW to support the Boulcott Alternative alignment through the Consent and Designation process.*

- 6.2b *Notes that the Boulcott Alternative is acceptable to the Boulcott Golf Club.*
- 6.2c *Notes that, to implement the Boulcott Alternative and to stay within the fiscal envelope, the works on the next priority reach, the City Centre, will have to be delayed by one year.*
- 6.2d *Notes that the bund proposed on the western boundary of the Hutt golf course to reduce the frequency of overflows from the Hutt River will have its crest level set to the observed October 1998 flood levels.*
- 6.2.e *That officers hold discussions with Boulcott Golf Club at an early stage regarding the relocation of the club house.*
- 6.2f *That officers carry out discussions with Boulcott Golf Club on the quantum of compensation with the view to seeing if any further reductions in the value of compensation and other costs associated with the Boulcott Alternative alignment can be achieved.*
- 6.2g *That if officers cannot reach a satisfactory agreement with the Boulcott Golf Club on the basis of Recommendation 6.2a they should proceed with obtaining statutory approval and the detailed design for the Boulcott/Hutt stopbank on the basis of the Green alignment.*

Moved as an amendment

(Cr Glensor/Cr Baird)

That the third bullet point of 6.2a read:

- *Transfers the title of the BGC land to GW on the condition that GW lease back the land to the club at a nominal rate while the Boulcott Golf Club remains a separate functioning club with a nine hole golf course on the site.*

*This amendment was put to the vote, **carried**, and became part of the substantive motion.*

Moved as an amendment

(Cr Gwilliam)

That the additional costs of the Boulcott Alternative alignment over the Green alignment be a special rate on the ratepayers of Hutt City.

This amendment was not seconded.

*The substantive motion was then put to a vote, a Division was called, and the motion was **carried** 7-6.*

HRA 76 Hutt River Floodplain Management Report: Project Manager's Report

Report 08.124

File: N/03/13/25

Resolved

(Cr Kirton./Cr Baird)

That the Subcommittee

(1) Receives the report.

(2) Notes the contents of the report.

HRA 77 General

There were no matters of general business.

The meeting closed at 7.08pm

Cr S V GREIG
Chairperson

Date: 13 March 2008