



Confirmed Minutes of the Annual Plan 2014/15 Hearing Committee meeting held in the Council Chamber, Greater Wellington Regional Council, Shed 39, 2 Fryatt Quay, Wellington, on Tuesday, 27 May 2014 at 9.33am, Wednesday, 28 May 2014 at 9.35am, Thursday 29 May 2014 at 9.35am and Thursday 12 June 2014 at 11.50am

Tuesday 27 May

Present

Councillors Donaldson (Chair), Aitken, Bruce, Greig, Kedgley (until 5.25pm), Laban, Lamason, Swain, Wilde and Wilson.

1 Apologies

Moved

(Cr Greig/ Cr Lamason)

That the Committee accepts the apologies for absence from Councillors Laidlaw and McPhee.

The motion was **CARRIED**.

2 Conflict of Interest declarations

There were no declarations of conflict of interest.

3 Process for hearing submissions on the draft Annual Plan 2014/15 and other matters that are the subject of concurrent consultation

Moved

(Cr Greig/ Cr Wilson)

That the Committee:

- 1. Receives the report.*
- 2. Notes the content of the report.*
- 3. Accepts the late submissions received on the draft Annual Plan 2014/15 (including the proposal for integrated water services), for consideration.*
- 4. Accepts the late submissions received on the draft Regional Public Transport Plan 2014 for consideration.*
- 5. Reports its findings and recommendations to the Council.*

The motion was **CARRIED**.

4 Report on Submissions on draft Annual Plan 2014/15

Report 14.257

File: SP/11/01/01

Moved

(Cr Wilson/ Cr Aitken)

That the Committee:

- 1. Receives the report.*
- 2. Notes the content of the report.*
- 3. Considers the information in this report and attachments in determining its findings and recommendations to Council.*

The motion was **CARRIED**.

5 Hearing of oral submissions

A timetable of oral submissions was circulated. There were changes to the scheduled timetable as some submitters did not appear and some organisations were represented by different personnel.

Oral submitters were heard in the following order:

Tuesday 27 May

Time	Submission	Name and organisation
------	------------	-----------------------

	No.	
9.35 – 9.45	79	Federated Farmers (Sarah Crofoot & Anders Crofoot)
9.45 – 9.51	41	Ferial Falconer
9.51 - 10.04	23	Sport Wellington (Phil Gibbons)
10.04 – 10.25	67	EECA (Robert Linterman)
10.15 – 10.25	58	Tbfree (Matthew Hall and Lesley Campbell)
10.25 – 10.37	75	Blind Foundation (Carina Duke)

The meeting adjourned at 10.37am and reconvened at 10.58am.

11.00-11.10	51	Lynn Jordan
11.10 - 11.14		Pita Noanoa
11.14– 11.18	47	Julie Buckley
11.18- 11.22	55	Riki Heimer
11.22 – 11.28	25	Mary Byrne
	26	FAANZ (Mary Byrne)
11.28 -11.49	12	Fluoride Information Network for Dentists (Stan Litras)

The meeting adjourned at 11.52am and reconvened at 12.09pm

12.09 – 12.23	66 (& 507)	Cycle Aware Wgtn (Hilleke Townsend) dAP & dRPTP
12.23 – 12.51	76 (& 313)	Anne Simpson – dAP & dRPTP
	74 (& 442)	OraTaiao (Liz Springford) – dAP & dRPTP
12.51 – 1.01	84	ARAC (Andy Cockroft)
1.01 – 1.17	29	Kapiti WEA (Jill Stansfield)
	30	Kapiti Older Persons Council (Jill Stansfield)
1.17 – 1.24	2	Democrats for Social Credit (Ron England)

The meeting adjourned at 1.24pm and reconvened at 2.00pm

2.00 – 2.09	88	Alana Bowman
2.09 – 2.17	61	Wellington Central Grey Power (Alana Bowman)
2.17 – 2.27	3	River Trail Committee for Combined Rotary Clubs (Robin Maud)
2.27 – 2.30	37	Leslie Brown (Nancy's Embroidery Shop)
2.30 - 2.49	62	Enviroschools (Karyn Burgess)

2.49 – 2.57	49	Guy Armstrong
2.57 – 3.06	73 (& 371)	Frank Cook – dAP & dRPTP
3.06 – 3.22	72	Hutt City Council (Max Shierlaw)
3.22 – 3.33	77 (& 265)	Upper Hutt City Council (Wayne Guppy) – dAP & dRPTP
3.33 – 3.53	81 (& 596)	Tony Randle – dAP & dRPTP
3.53 – 3.59	69	Nicola Young (WCC Councillor)
3.59 – 4.05	60	Sarah Free (WCC Councillor)
4.05 – 4.12	80	Living Streets Aotearoa (Paula Warren)
4.12 – 4.16	78	Friends of Baring Head (Paul Warren)
4.16 – 4.29	31	PSA (Nick Kelly)

The meeting adjourned at 4.29pm and reconvened at 4.56pm.

The Committee commenced its deliberations.

The meeting adjourned at 6.19pm and reconvened on Wednesday 28 May 2014 at 9.35am.

Wednesday 28 May

Present

Councillors Donaldson (Chair), Aitken (until 3.46pm), Bruce, Greig, Kedgley, Laban, Lamason, Swain, Wilde and Wilson.

6 Apologies

Moved

(Cr Donaldson/ Cr Aitken)

That the Committee accepts the apologies for absence from Councillors Laidlaw and McPhee.

The motion was **CARRIED**.

7 Summary of submissions on the draft Regional Public Transport Plan 2014

Report 14.285

File: TD/02/10/06

Moved

(Cr Wilson/ Cr Aitken)

That the Committee:

1. *Receives the report.*
2. *Notes the content of the report.*
3. *Considers the information in this report and attachments in determining its findings and recommendations to Council.*

The motion was **CARRIED**.

8 **Hearing of oral submissions**

Oral submitters were heard in the following order:

Time	Submission No.	Name and organisation
9.36 – 9.41	62	Phil Kelliher
9.41 – 9.49	239	Leigh Ramsey
9.49 – 9.55	624	Councillor Penny Gaylor for Kapiti Coast District Council
9.55 – 10.02	306	James Barber
10.02 – 10.09	571	Robert Vale
10.09 – 10.16	512	Tim Bollinger
10.16 – 10.22	259	Elliot O'Sullivan
10.22 – 10.28	501	Ruth Pemberton
10.28 – 10.35	489	Ken New

The meeting adjourned at 10.35am and reconvened at 10.48am.

10.49 – 11.06	425	Transdev Australasia (Jonathan Metcalfe, CEO)
11.06 – 11.25	453	NZ Bus Limited (Scott Thornem GM Strategy and Zane Fulljames, CEO)
11.25 – 11.36	431	Bus and Coach Association New Zealand (Barry Kidd, CEO and Jasmine Koh, Legal Advisor)

The meeting adjourned at 11.36am and reconvened at 11.46am.

11.46 – 12.04	633	New Zealand Transport Agency (Lyndon Hammond, Regional Manager, Planning and Investment, Central and Amy Kearse, Principal Planning Advisor)
---------------	-----	--

12.04 – 12.14	422	Victoria University of Wellington (Jenny Bentley and Andrew Wilks)
12.14 – 12.22	532	Nicholas Marshall
12.22 – 12.30	419	Wellington Civic Trust (Mike Mellor)
12.30 – 12.39	437	Michael Mellor (<i>individual</i>)
12.39- 12.47	433	Energy Efficiency and Conservation Authority (Joern Scherzer)

The meeting adjourned at 12.47pm and reconvened at 1.30pm.

1.30 – 1.37	577	Members of the Eastern Community Committee of Hutt City Council (Michael Ellis)
1.37 – 1.43	605	Brian Burrell
1.44 – 1.49	353	Trish Enright
1.49 – 1.59	409	Marsden Village Assn Inc. (Barrie Keenan & Ant Simon)
1.59 – 2.06	424	Houghton Valley Progressive Association (Linda Cameron)
2.06 – 2.11	460	Churton Park Community Association (Richard Taylor, John Morrison)
2.11 – 2.21	550	Wilton Residents' Association (Robert, may arrive late)
2.21 – 2.36	482	Roland Sapsford

The meeting adjourned at 2.36pm and reconvened at 2.42pm.

2.43 – 2.48	429	Colin Pearce <i>for</i> James Michaels
2.48 – 3.00	227	NZ Tramways & Public Passenger Transport Employees Union Inc (Kevin O'Sullivan)
3.00 – 3.12	639	Justin Lester <i>for</i> Wellington City Council
3.12 – 3.18	344	Grant Griffiths
3.19 – 3.24	59	Frank and Julia Quirke
3.24 – 3.32	335	Kerry Wood
3.33 – 3.41	430	Snapper Services Limited
3.41 – 3.46	441	Fred MacDonald

The meeting adjourned at 3.46pm and reconvened at 3.57pm.

3.57 – 4.06	590	Greg Bodnar
4.06 – 4.15	637	Chris Horne & Barbara Mitcalfe
4.16 – 4.22	110	Paul McCardle
4.22 – 4.28	557	Andrew Wright
4.28 – 4.35	390	Diane Cameron

The meeting adjourned at 4.35pm and reconvened at on Thursday 29 May 2014 at 9.35am.

Thursday 29 May

Present

Councillors Donaldson (Chair), Aitken, Bruce, Greig, Kedgley, Laban, Lamason, Swain, Wilde (from 12.23pm) and Wilson.

9 Apologies

Moved

(Cr Donaldson / Cr Aitken)

That the Committee accepts the apologies for absence from Councillors Laidlaw and McPhee.

The motion was **CARRIED**.

10 Hearing of oral submissions

Oral submitters were heard in the following order:

Time	Submission No.	Name and organisation
9.36 – 9.42	143	Ross Anderson
9.42 – 9.48	251	Nicole Cottrell
9.48 – 10.03	602	Khandallah Residents' Association (Dermot Byrne)

The meeting resumed its deliberations on the draft Annual Plan 2014/15.

11 Report on Submissions on draft Annual Plan 2014/15

The Committee completed its consideration of Report 14.257 (see item 4).

Moved

(Cr Lamason/ Cr Wilson)

That the Committee:

4. *Recommends to the Council changes to the draft Annual Plan 2013/14 as recommended by Officers in Attachment 1, subject to the following amendments:*

Moved as an amendment

(Cr Swain/ Cr Wilde)

That the Committee:

Recommends to the Council that there be no passenger transport fare increases for 2014/15.

The amendment was **CARRIED** and became part of the substantive motion.

Moved as an amendment

(Cr Donaldson/ Cr Lamason)

That the Committee:

Recommends to the Council approval of the \$30,000 per annum requested by Enviroschools from the 2014/15 Annual Plan, to enable the necessary changes and complement investments being made by territorial authorities in the region.

The amendment was **CARRIED** and became part of the substantive motion.

The substantive motion was then put to the vote and was **CARRIED**.

The Committee commenced its deliberations on the proposal for integrated delivery for water services.

Moved

(Cr Aitken/ Cr Wilson)

That the Committee:

1. *Notes the content of submissions received on the proposal for the integrated delivery of water services, including the submission from Upper Hutt City Council that the proposed Water Committee should be a joint committee of the shareholding local authorities.*
2. *Notes that each of the local authorities with a shareholding in Capacity Infrastructure Services Limited is currently considering their position in relation to the proposal, and that their position will be taken into account by Council when making a final decision on the proposal.*
3. *Recommends to Council no changes to the proposal for the integrated delivery of water services set out in the Statement of Proposal as a result of the consideration of submissions.*

4. *Recommends that Council agrees in principle to the proposal, subject to resolving any issues of detail with shareholder councils.*

The motion was **CARRIED**.

Councillor Kedgley asked that her abstention be recorded.

The meeting adjourned at 10.40am and reconvened at 10.50am.

The Committee resumed hearing oral submissions on the draft Regional Public Transport Plan 2014.

Oral submitters were heard in the following order:

Time	Submission No.	Name and organisation
10.51 – 10.59	555	Malcolm Wheeler
10.59 – 11.03	594	John Wilson
11.03 – 11.11	360	Dr. Nick Lambrechtsen
11.11 – 11.25	621	Henry Steele
11.25 – 11.33	514	Robert Mayo QSM
11.33 – 11.44	407	Kay Jones
11.44 – 11.52	483	Martin Burton
11.52 – 12.05	583	The Raumati Station Action Group (John Grundy)
12.05 – 12.12	450	Khandallah Cornerstone Resource Centre Trust Board (Jeanette Brunton)
12.12 – 12.20	568	The City Is Ours, Inc. (Maria van der Meel)
12.20 – 12.52	545	VUW Students' Association (Sonya Clark, Rick Zwaan and Steph Gregor)

The meeting adjourned at 12.52pm and reconvened at 1.24pm.

1.26 – 1.33	192	Norman Wilkins
1.33 – 1.40	285	Trams Action (Rob Martin)
1.40 – 1.48	505	Allan Nielson
1.49 – 1.55	642	Toni Izzard
1.55 – 2.04	497	Aro Valley Community (Madeline Rashbrooke & Jacqui Tutt)
2.04 – 2.12	612	Kirsten Forsyth

2.14 – 2.33	148	Zero Emission Vehicles (Andrew Rushworth)
-------------	-----	---

The meeting adjourned at 2.33pm and reconvened at 2.40pm.

2.40 – 2.47	80	Alexey Maksimov
2.47 – 3.03	597	Michael Flinn
3.03 – 3.11	520	Robert Holdsworth
3.11 – 3.16	540	Chris Renwick
3.16 – 3.27	548	Chris Norton
3.27 – 3.33	466	Tim Edwards

The meeting adjourned at 3.33pm and reconvened at 3.43pm.

3.43 – 3.52	585	Ann Bain <i>for</i> Blind Citizens NZ Inc.
3.52 – 3.58	499	Thomas Bryant <i>for</i> Blind Foundation
3.58 – 4.07	516	Bryce Pender
4.07 – 4.13	188	Sridhar Ekambaram
4.13 – 4.22	527	Russell Tregonning
4.22 – 4.38	438	Living Streets Aotearoa (Ellen Blake)
	638	Ellen Blake
4.38 – 4.52	481	MANA Newtown (Warwick Taylor and Ariana Paretutanganui-Tamati)

Moved

(Cr Donaldson / Cr Wilson)

That the Committee adjourns the meeting until Thursday 12 June 2014 at 11.50am.

The motion was **CARRIED**.

Thursday 12 June

Present

Councillors Donaldson (Chair), Aitken, Bruce, Greig, Kedgley, Laban, Lamason, Swain, Wilde and Wilson.

12 Apologies

Moved

(Cr Donaldson/ Cr Aitken)

That the Committee accepts the apologies for absence from Councillors Laidlaw and McPhee.

The motion was **CARRIED**.

13 **Summary of submissions on the draft Regional Public Transport Plan 2014**

An update of Attachment 1 to Report 14.285 was tabled.

A copy of technical advice concerning Wellington's trolley bus network and potential alternatives was tabled. This advice responded to questions raised by Councillors during the consultation and includes a presentation given to Councillors at a workshop on 4 June 2014.

A consolidated version of officer recommendations contained within the updated Attachment 1 to Report 14.285 was tabled.

An officer response to two additional questions raised by Councillors was tabled.

The Committee agreed that members who had already spoken to a motion would not be precluded from moving an amendment to the motion.

The meeting adjourned at 1pm and reconvened at 1.40pm.

The Committee completed its consideration of Report 14.285 (see item 7).

Moved

(Cr Swain/ Cr Aitken)

That the Committee:

1. *Notes the submissions.*
2. *Notes that submissions raised a number of issues or suggestions that do not require change to the Regional Public Transport Plan, but that should be addressed through existing work programmes, and refer submissions on the following topics or sub-topics to officers for consideration:*
 - *Current bus routes*
 - *Bus stop and shelter design*
 - *Bus stops and shelters*
 - *Coastlands bus stop*
 - *Current rail services*

- *Information at stops and stations*
 - *Real time information*
 - *Customer experience*
 - *Accessibility*
 - *Bike racks on buses*
 - *Bikes on trains*
 - *Comfort*
 - *Timetables*
 - *Wi-Fi*
 - *25% off peak discount*
 - *Fare capping*
 - *Errors identified in Metlink publications*
 - *Walking and cycling routes*
 - *Network integration*
 - *Network branding*
 - *Training for drivers*
 - *Vehicle standards*
 - *Vehicle windows*
 - *Fare collection*
 - *Consistent branding*
 - *Customer information*
 - *Marketing*
 - *Providing for the transport disadvantaged*
 - *Contract requirements*
 - *Unit transition plan*
 - *Park and ride facilities*
 - *Wellington bus review network design*
 - *Bus rapid transit.*
3. *Recommends that Council requests officers to investigate the proposal from Wellington Cable Car Limited that the Cable Car could be included in the Metlink network in future Regional Public Transport Plans.*
 4. *Recommends that Council notes the submission from Wellington City Council and tertiary students and invite Wellington City to contribute towards funding a discount of tertiary student fares of either 50% at all times, or 25% at peak.*
 5. *Recommends that Council supports proposals for increased collaboration with operators and local councils, and in particular in order to deliver bus rapid transit.*
 6. *Notes changes to local routes identified in the draft PT Plan can be made following targeted consultation with the local community and the operator, and that proposals to change local services such as in Khandallah and Churton Park and Victoria University will be further developed through targeted consultation with the local residents on route options and market research, during the second half of 2014.*

7. *Recommends to Council that the following amendments (as set out in the updated Attachment 1 to Report 14.285) be made to the draft Regional Public Transport Plan:*
- a) To correct identified errors.*
 - b) To emphasise the importance of collaboration with local councils, and in particular in order to deliver bus rapid transit.*
 - c) To include a coverage map of the proposed network and to clarify that maps and diagrams contained within the PT Plan are necessarily generic and indicative given that specific bus route details are still subject to development.*
 - d) To amend the action under policy 4.a to include taking into account the needs of the transport disadvantaged.*
 - e) To provide further detail in the policy on the process for establishing units (including how incumbent operators will be involved in identifying and agreeing like for like units), and to provide more detail on the timing of the procurement processes once that information is available.*
 - f) To emphasise that the proposed RSI service design will be further developed taking into account community feedback, and that expenditure on Upper Hutt Station is expected to occur in 2014/15.*
 - g) To clarify that further consultation on the Wellington city bus network will occur where local communities have identified concerns, including for Khandallah and Churton Park and Victoria University.*
 - h) To include an increase in frequency for bus route 46.*
 - i) To clarify that the proposed Wellington bus network will not reduce service levels, where the services are well-patronised and that corrections be made in the final PT Plan to make clear that the proposed hours of operation do indeed have no change where this is the case.*

With regard to the proposed renewal of the Wellington City bus fleet recommends to Council that it:

- 8. Agrees that the criteria for the evaluation of the options for the future bus fleet are: Where, when and how people want to travel, reducing carbon and other harmful emissions, cost, and noise impacts, and that the most important criteria is where when and how people want to travel.*
- 9. Notes that the greatest potential for reducing carbon and local emissions from transport is by increasing public transport use, and therefore reconfirms the PT Plan goal of growing patronage by continually improving the Metlink public transport so that services:*
 - Go where people want to go, at the times they want to travel*
 - Provide competitive journey times*
 - Provide value for money*
 - Are easy to understand and use*
 - Are safe, comfortable and reliable*
 - Provide flexibility, allowing people to change their plans.*

10. *Agrees in principle to the goal of a fully electric future bus fleet for Wellington, which should occur at the point battery electric buses are able to reliably and cost effectively deliver high capacity services.*
11. *Agrees in principle that diesel-electric hybrid buses are the preferred option for new buses during the transition from the current fleet until the point the future electric fleet becomes viable, on the basis that diesel-electric hybrid buses provide a cost effective way of reducing harmful local emissions, carbon emissions and noise.*
12. *Recommends to Council that the draft Regional Public Transport Plan be amended to reflect the decisions of recommendations 10 and 11.*
13. *Requests officers to report back to Council with further analysis on options for high-capacity diesel-electric hybrid vehicles and a transition plan for the introduction of diesel-electric hybrid vehicles.*
14. *Agrees that, given the magnitude of current and future costs for the power supply required to operate trolley buses, the existing contract for trolley bus routes not be renewed when it expires in 2017.*

Moved as an amendment

(Cr Wilson/ Cr Greig)

That recommendation 4 be replaced with the following words:

Notes the submission from Wellington City Council and tertiary students, and invite Wellington City to contribute towards funding 100% of tertiary student fares.

The amendment was **LOST**.

Moved as an amendment

(Cr Laban/ Cr Wilde)

That recommendation 4 be replaced with the following words:

That as well as the proposed discount for non-peak fares, the Council consider applying a 25% student discount on peak fares provided that there is substantial financial support from Wellington City Council and the tertiary education institutions in the region.

The amendment was **CARRIED** and became part of the substantive motion.

Moved as an amendment

(Cr Kedgley/ Cr Bruce)

That recommendation 11 be replaced with the following words:

- a) *Before agreeing that hybrids are the preferred option, agrees to trial diesel – electric hybrid buses to see whether they can be effective in Wellington conditions and as a mode of Bus Rapid Transport.*
- b) *Agrees to continue to use trolley buses on the East-West route until such time as a future battery-powered electric fleet becomes viable and effective.*
- c) *Agrees to trial a modern trolley bus with modern batteries and regenerative braking to assess its effectiveness and energy savings.*

Agrees to remove Euro 1-4 buses from the bus fleet over the next five years.

Agrees to engage specialise independent consultants to advise the Council on the minimum necessary expenditure on the maintenance and ancillary protective gear to make the network reliable.

Agrees to undertake a detailed assessment of the health effects of diesel and hybrid diesel buses.

Agrees to upgrade the network so that the existing trolley bus fleet can be used until better alternative electric buses are available.

The amendment was **LOST**.

The substantive motion was **CARRIED**.

Noted:

Noted:

Councillors Bruce, Greig and Wilson requested that their votes in favour of the first proposed amendment to recommendation 4 be recorded.

Councillors Kedgley and Bruce requested that their votes in favour of the proposed amendment to 11 be recorded.

Councillors Kedgley and Bruce requested that their votes against recommendation 11 be recorded.

Councillor Bruce requested that his abstention from voting on recommendation 12 be recorded.

Councillors Kedgley requested that her vote against recommendation 12 be recorded.

Councillors Kedgley and Bruce requested that their votes against recommendation 14 be recorded.

Officers were commended for their work on the draft Regional Public Transport Plan.

The meeting closed at 3.25pm.

Cr B Donaldson
(Chair)

Date