

Appendix 1: Submitters' recommended amendments to provisions – Forestry and Vegetation Clearance rebuttal evidence

This document sets out only the provisions of the notified version of Proposed Change 1 for which submitter evidence was specifically received on.

Provisions as notified are shown in black text. Section 42A recommended amendments are shown in **red text**. Additions are **underlined** and deletions are **~~struck through~~**. Recommended amendments from submitters' evidence are shown in **blue text**. Additions are **underlined** and deletions are **~~struck through~~**.

Afforestation

| Submitter | Recommended amendments |
|--|--|
| Guildford Timber Company Limited, Silverstream Forest Limited and Goodwin Estate Trust | Delete the definition from being allocated to the FPP. |

Harvesting

| Submitter | Recommended amendments |
|---|--|
| Guildford Timber Company Limited, Silverstream Forest Limited and | Delete the definition from being allocated to the FPP. |

| Submitter | Recommended amendments |
|----------------------|------------------------|
| Goodwin Estate Trust | |

Highest erosion risk land (woody vegetation)

| Submitter | Recommended amendments |
|---------------------|--|
| Winstone Aggregates | Reallocate the definition to be subject to the P1S1 process. |

Mechanical land preparation

| Submitter | Recommended amendments |
|--|--|
| Guildford Timber Company Limited, Silverstream Forest Limited and Goodwin Estate Trust | Delete the definition from being allocated to the FPP. |

Replanting

| Submitter | Recommended amendments |
|---|--|
| Guildford Timber Company Limited, Silverstream Forest Limited and | Delete the definition from being allocated to the FPP. |

| Submitter | Recommended amendments |
|----------------------|------------------------|
| Goodwin Estate Trust | |

Vegetation clearance

| Submitter | Recommended amendments |
|--|--|
| Guildford Timber Company Limited, Silverstream Forest Limited and Goodwin Estate Trust | Delete the definition from being allocated to the FPP. |
| New Zealand Carbon Farming Group | Vegetation clearance (commercial forestry for the purposes of Rules WH.R20, WH.R21 and P.P.19, P.P.20 for the purposes of Rules [add rules]) |

Policy WH.P28

| Submitter | Recommended amendments |
|-------------------------------|---|
| China National Forestry Group | <p>[...]</p> <p>(a) requiring the resource consent application to demonstrate that erosion and any discharge of sediment will be minimised, having regard to the quality of the receiving environment; particularly in part Freshwater Management Unit's where visual clarity TAS are not met or there is a downstream receiving environment that is sensitive to sediment accumulation; and requiring resource consent applications to document the management practices that will be applied to manage and limit erosion processes that may contribute to discharges of sediment into receiving waters environments</p> <p>[...]</p> |

| Submitter | Recommended amendments |
|--|--|
| Guildford Timber Company Limited, Silverstream Forest Limited and Goodwin Estate Trust | Delete recommended amendments that introduce the planning mechanism to determine when a restricted discretionary activity resource consent is required and instead rely upon the NES-CF, or otherwise redraft to address any resource management matters that are not already regulated by the NES-CF. |

Rule WH.R17

| Submitter | Recommended amendments |
|---|---|
| New Zealand Transport Agency Waka Kotahi | <p><u>[...]</u></p> <p><u>The use of land, and the associated discharge of sediment into water or onto or into land where it may enter water from vegetation clearance on erosion prone land is a permitted activity where:</u></p> <p><u>(a) _____</u> <u>[...]</u></p> <p><u>Or</u></p> <p><u>(aa) _____ any vegetation clearance associated with the repair and maintenance of existing roads and tracks, or</u></p> <p><u>(b) _____</u> <u>[...]</u></p> |
| Winstone Aggregates | Reallocate the provision to be subject to the P1S1 process. |
| Environmental Defence Society | The standards in (a)(i)-(iii) to also apply to (b) and (c). |

Rule WH.R18

| Submitter | Recommended amendments |
|------------------------|---|
| Winstone Aggregates | Reallocate the provision to be subject to the P1S1 process. |

Rule WH.R19

| Submitter | Recommended amendments |
|------------------------|---|
| Winstone Aggregates | Reallocate the provision to be subject to the P1S1 process. |

Note above Rule WH.R20

| Submitter | Recommended amendments |
|--|--|
| New Zealand Carbon Farming Group | <p>[...]</p> <p><u>Part 2 Regulation of commercial plantation forestry activities</u></p> <p><u>Subpart 1—Afforestation</u></p> <p><u>Regulations 9(2), 10, 10A 14(3), 15(5), 16(2), 17(1), 17(3), and 17(4)</u></p> <p><u>Subpart 3—Earthworks</u></p> <p><u>Regulations 24 to 35</u></p> <p><u>Subpart 6—Harvesting</u></p> <p><u>Regulation 63(2), 64, as far as these apply to a Regional Council, 65 to 69, 70(3) and (4), and 71</u></p> <p><u>Subpart 7—Mechanical land preparation</u></p> |

| Submitter | Recommended amendments |
|-----------|--|
| | <p><u>Regulations 73(2), 74, and 75</u></p> <p><u>Subpart 8—Replanting</u></p> <p><u>Regulations 77(2), 77A, 78(2), and (3), 78A, 80, and 81(3) and (4)</u></p> <p><u>Subpart 9—Ancillary activities</u></p> <p><u>Regulations 89 and 90 Regulation 95, as far as this applies to a Regional Council</u></p> <p><u>Subpart 10—General provisions (including discharges of sediment)</u></p> <p>Regulation 97(1) (a), (b), (c), (d), (e) and (f) and (g)</p> |

Rule WH.R20

| Submitter | Recommended amendments |
|--|--|
| New Zealand Farm Forestry Association | Should it be deemed necessary to be more stringent than the NES-CF, then remove afforestation and replanting from Rule WH.R20. |
| Guildford Timber Company Limited, Silverstream Forest Limited and Goodwin Estate Trust | Delete the explanatory note above Rule WH.R20 and instead rely upon the NES-CF, or otherwise redraft to address any resource management matters that are not already regulated by the NES-CF. |
| New Zealand Carbon Farming Group | <p>[...]</p> <p><u>The discharge of sediment to a surface waterbody associated with Afforestation, harvesting, earthworks, vegetation clearance (commercial forestry), replanting or mechanical land preparation for commercial plantation forestry, and any associated discharge of sediment to a surface water body, where the most recent Wellington Regional Council monitoring record measure of visual clarity for the</u></p> |

| Submitter | Recommended amendments |
|-----------|---|
| | <p><u>relevant catchment does not meet the target attribute state at any monitoring site within the relevant part Freshwater Management Unit set out in Table 9.2, is a restricted discretionary activity, providing the following conditions are met:</u></p> <p>[...]</p> |

Policy P.P26

| Submitter | Recommended amendments |
|-------------------------------|---|
| Porirua City Council | <p>[...]</p> <p><u>(a) requiring the resource consent application to demonstrate that erosion and any discharge of sediment will to be minimised [...]</u></p> <p>[...]</p> |
| China National Forestry Group | <p>[...]</p> <p>(a) requiring the resource consent application to demonstrate that erosion and any discharge of sediment will be minimised, having regard to the quality of the receiving environment; particularly in part Freshwater Management Unit's where the target attribute state for visual clarity in Table 9.2 are not met or there is a downstream receiving environment that is sensitive to sediment accumulation; and requiring resource consent applications to document the management practices that will be applied to manage and limit erosion processes that may contribute to discharges of sediment into receiving waters environments</p> <p>[...]</p> |

Rule P.R16

| Submitter | Recommended amendments |
|---|---|
| New Zealand Transport Agency Waka Kotahi | <p>[...]</p> <p><u>The use of land, and the associated discharge of sediment into water or onto or into land where it may enter water from vegetation clearance on erosion prone land is a permitted activity where:</u></p> |

| Submitter | Recommended amendments |
|----------------------------------|--|
| | <p>(a) <u> </u> [...]</p> <p><u>Or</u></p> <p>(aa) <u> </u> any vegetation clearance associated with the repair and maintenance of existing roads and tracks, or</p> <p>(b) <u> </u> [...]</p> |
| Winstone Aggregates | Reallocate the provision to be subject to the P1S1 process. |
| Environmental Defence Society | The standards in (a)(i)-(iii) to also apply to (b) and (c). |

Rule P.R17

| Submitter | Recommended amendments |
|------------------------|---|
| Winstone Aggregates | Reallocate the provision to be subject to the P1S1 process. |

Rule P.R18

| Submitter | Recommended amendments |
|------------------------|---|
| Winstone Aggregates | Reallocate the provision to be subject to the P1S1 process. |

Note above Rule P.R19

| Submitter | Recommended amendments |
|----------------------------------|---|
| New Zealand Carbon Farming Group | <p data-bbox="477 252 521 284">[...]</p> <p data-bbox="477 300 1205 331"><u>Part 2 Regulation of commercial plantation forestry activities</u></p> <p data-bbox="477 355 779 387"><u>Subpart 1—Afforestation</u></p> <p data-bbox="477 403 1283 435"><u>Regulations 9(2), 10, 10A 14(3), 15(5), 16(2), 17(1), 17(3), and 17(4)</u></p> <p data-bbox="477 459 757 491"><u>Subpart 3—Earthworks</u></p> <p data-bbox="477 507 723 539"><u>Regulations 24 to 35</u></p> <p data-bbox="477 563 757 595"><u>Subpart 6—Harvesting</u></p> <p data-bbox="477 611 1608 643"><u>Regulation 63(2), 64, as far as these apply to a Regional Council, 65 to 69, 70(3) and (4), and 71</u></p> <p data-bbox="477 667 969 699"><u>Subpart 7—Mechanical land preparation</u></p> <p data-bbox="477 715 835 746"><u>Regulations 73(2), 74, and 75</u></p> <p data-bbox="477 770 757 802"><u>Subpart 8—Replanting</u></p> <p data-bbox="477 818 1249 850"><u>Regulations 77(2), 77A, 78(2), and (3), 78A, 80, and 81(3) and (4)</u></p> <p data-bbox="477 874 846 906"><u>Subpart 9—Ancillary activities</u></p> <p data-bbox="477 922 1429 954"><u>Regulations 89 and 90 Regulation 95, as far as this applies to a Regional Council</u></p> <p data-bbox="477 978 1272 1010"><u>Subpart 10—General provisions (including discharges of sediment)</u></p> <p data-bbox="477 1026 1070 1058"><u>Regulation 97(1)(a), (b), (c), (d), (e) and (f) and (g)</u></p> |

Rule P.R19

| Submitter | Recommended amendments |
|---------------------------------------|---|
| New Zealand Farm Forestry Association | Should it be deemed necessary to be more stringent than the NES-CF, then remove afforestation and replanting from Rule P.R19. |

| Submitter | Recommended amendments |
|----------------------------------|---|
| Porirua City Council | Suggests taking the average over a specified timeframe may be more appropriate than the most recent Wellington Regional Council monitoring record for visual clarity. |
| New Zealand Carbon Farming Group | <p data-bbox="477 344 517 373">[...]</p> <p data-bbox="477 395 2112 568"><u>The discharge of sediment to a surface waterbody associated with Afforestation, harvesting, earthworks, vegetation clearance (commercial forestry), replanting or mechanical land preparation for commercial plantation forestry, and any associated discharge of sediment to a surface water body, where the most recent Wellington Regional Council monitoring record measure of visual clarity for the relevant catchment does not meet the target attribute state at any monitoring site within the relevant part Freshwater Management Unit set out in Table 9.2, is a restricted discretionary activity, providing the following conditions are met:</u></p> <p data-bbox="477 590 517 619">[...]</p> |

Schedule 34A

| Submitter | Recommended amendments |
|--|--|
| New Zealand Carbon Farming Group | <p data-bbox="477 833 517 861">[...]</p> <p data-bbox="477 884 633 912">2. <u>Map</u></p> <p data-bbox="577 935 618 963">[...]</p> <p data-bbox="577 986 1417 1015">e) <u>the contour lines at intervals less than or equal to 5 20 metres:</u></p> <p data-bbox="577 1037 618 1066">[...]</p> |
| Guildford Timber Company Limited, Silverstream Forest Limited and Goodwin Estate Trust | Delete Schedule and replace with a note referencing the NES-CF Schedules apply |

Schedule 34B

| Submitter | Recommended amendments |
|--|---|
| New Zealand Carbon Farming Group | [...] 2. <u>Map</u> [...] d) <u>the contour lines at intervals less than or equal to 20 metres:</u> [...] |
| Guildford Timber Company Limited, Silverstream Forest Limited and Goodwin Estate Trust | Delete Schedule and replace with a note referencing the NES-CF Schedules apply |

Schedule 34C

| Submitter | Recommended amendments |
|--|--|
| Guildford Timber Company Limited, Silverstream Forest Limited and Goodwin Estate Trust | Delete Schedule and replace with a note referencing the NES-CF Schedules apply |

